



Universitas Hasanuddin

**Bama Andika Putra (Direktorat Kemitraan Internasional) <bama@unhas.ac.id>**

---

**feedback on your manuscript ASIAN AFFAIRS: AN AMERICAN REVIEW**

13 messages

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Fri, Mar 25, 2022 at 12:18 AM

To: bama@unhas.ac.id, Paul Chambers &lt;pwchambers@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Bama Andika Putra,

I am writing to you in regard to your submitted manuscript to Asian Affairs: An American Review.

The two reviewers looked at your work and each of them wants you to make major revisions. (SEE BELOW\_

I want you to send me 2 new papers.

1. The modified manuscript after correcting for the comments of the two reviewers. Changes must be in color.
2. A separate paper which enumerates each reviewer's comments and tells where (page number) all of the places are in the manuscript where you have made changes.

Send these two attachments to me at this email address.

Thank you.

Sincerely, Paul Chambers,

Executive Editor, Asian Affairs: An American Review (SEE BELOW)

**Reviewer 1: Major Revision needed**

This paper tries to explore border conflict in north Natuna between Indonesia and Vietnam. However, author(s) did not display map figuring where border overlapping claims in the Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ) between Indonesia and Vietnam is. Author (s) do use 1) kinetic effect, 2) explicitness of messages, 3) balance of power among the countries, 4) policy is reactive or pre-emptive, and 5) sustainment of policy. Why do authors prefer to use this model than other. In LR, page 5 line 38 .... not concise and coherent academic debate on this topic. In short, LR is quite poor to explore the case.

**Findings**

Illustrating study cases of Indonesia's maritime diplomatic characteristics against Vietnam's IUUF in the North Natuna Sea missed data presented in table or statistics.

How did data analyzed in the Figure 1. Maritime diplomatic characteristics of the five study cases related to Indonesia's maritime diplomacy against Vietnam's IUUF in the North Natuna Seas.

**Reviewer 2: Reject and Resubmit**

The paper attempts to analyze border conflicts between Vietnam and Indonesia. Using Le Mière's framework, the authors look at five cases of recent incidents of illegal fishing in Indonesian waters to construe Indonesia's diplomatic strategies. There are several issues with the paper. First, the importance of the analysis is not well explained. The paper states that Vietnam is one of the nations in conflict with Indonesia over illegal fishing disputes. China is mentioned as continuing its aggressive manoeuvres in Indonesian waters (p. 3, line 34). As such, there is the question of how serious the Vietnamese threat really is. Second, there have been several hundred cases of vessels trespassing Indonesian waters, but the study only focuses on five incidents that occurred between 2020 and 2021 (p. 2, line 46). Why only five? Based on what criteria were they selected? Third, the paper talks about trends in maritime diplomacy, but the authors only analyse five recent cases. How about the other few hundred cases during Jokowi's first presidential term? Fourth, the paper doesn't discuss the implications of the results. That is, it is unclear what insight can be obtained through the case study analysis.

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Sat, Mar 26, 2022 at 11:06 AM

To: Paul Chambers &lt;pwchambers@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Paul Chambers,

Thank you very much for the reviews. We will do our best to complete the major revisions within 4 weeks. I will send the revisions as soon as it is completed.

Regards,

Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Sat, Mar 26, 2022 at 12:23 PM

To: Bama Andika Putra &lt;bama@unhas.ac.id&gt;

Thank you.  
Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 26 Mar BE 2565, at 10:06, Bama Andika Putra <[bama@unhas.ac.id](mailto:bama@unhas.ac.id)> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <[bama@unhas.ac.id](mailto:bama@unhas.ac.id)>  
To: Paul Chambers <[pwchambers@gmail.com](mailto:pwchambers@gmail.com)>

Tue, Apr 12, 2022 at 12:50 PM

Dear Paul Chambers,

We have completed the major revision of our article entitled: "Construing Indonesia's maritime diplomatic strategies against Vietnam's IUUF in the North Natuna Seas." Attached to this email is (1) revised manuscript (highlighted and commented), and (2) reviewer comments and the pages revised.

Thank you very much for your time and consideration,

Regards,  
Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

## 2 attachments



**[REV] Reviewer Comments and Revisions.docx**  
17K



**[REV] ANONYMOUS asian affairs maritime diplomacy copy 2.docx**  
1588K

---

**Paul Chambers** <[pwchambers@gmail.com](mailto:pwchambers@gmail.com)>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <[bama@unhas.ac.id](mailto:bama@unhas.ac.id)>

Tue, Apr 12, 2022 at 1:47 PM

Dear Bama Andika Putra,  
Thank you for your email. We will look at your modified manuscript and get back to you soon.

Many best regards,  
Paul

Dr. Paul Chambers  
Executive Editor  
[Asian Affairs: An American Review](#)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Paul Chambers** <[pwchambers@gmail.com](mailto:pwchambers@gmail.com)>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <[bama@unhas.ac.id](mailto:bama@unhas.ac.id)>

Tue, Apr 12, 2022 at 10:00 PM

Dear Bama Andika Putra,  
I have looked in detail at your modified paper. I like the changes you made in response to the reviewers' comments. For me, you would still need to make changes before this paper could be published. **You can find my detailed comments in the attached file.**

But in general:

- 1. You need to vastly improve your English in this paper. I understand that English is not your native language. But you need to have a native English speaker correct the English errors that exist throughout the paper. We cannot publish your paper without correct English. Please do not try to use a computer to find English mistakes. Please get a native English speaker to make the corrections.**
- In parts of your paper, you introduce your framework of analysis and then later you introduce your framework of analysis again. You can only do this one time.
- You need to put together a proper Introduction in which you state what you are examining, why you are examining it (why is it relevant), and what is your argument. You could also say that you are using a particular theory (but need not explain it in the Introduction).

Please take your time to do a good job. All of my comments are made to be constructive, nothing more. But the changes must be made. THANK YOU.

Many best regards,  
Dr. Paul Chambers  
Executive Editor  
Asian Affairs: An American Review

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **[REV] ANONYMOUS asian affairs maritime diplomacy edited PWC.docx**  
1593K

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <bama@unhas.ac.id>  
To: Paul Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Wed, Apr 13, 2022 at 4:36 AM

Dear Paul Chambers,

Thank you very much for your constructive feedback. I will make the revisions and return it back to you. In regards to the English, I will follow your suggestion to correct the article with a native English speaker. Hopefully all of the revisions can be completed within 3-4 weeks.

Regards,  
Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Wed, Apr 13, 2022 at 5:10 AM

Dear Bama,  
Thank you. Please take your time.  
Paul

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <bama@unhas.ac.id>  
To: Paul Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Wed, Apr 20, 2022 at 6:55 AM

Dear Paul Chambers,

Please find attached the revisions for our submitted article. I have made the following changes:

1. Reformulated the introduction section to include questions on; (1) what is examined, (2) why it is examined, (3) author's arguments, (4) reference to the theory used without deep elaboration,
2. Corrections to your in-text comments (acronyms, clarification of arguments in the abstract, reference system changed to endnote, paragraphs indented, elimination of the repetitive reference to the theory used),
3. English errors corrected and proofread by a native speaker.

Attached to this email is two documents, first is the clean version, and second is with tracked changes. Major revisions have been made to fix the English clarity issue that you pointed out. I hope that this version is sufficient enough for publication.


Regards,  
Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

## 2 attachments

 **Manuscript\_Bama\_FINAL.docx**  
1487K

 **Manuscript\_Bama\_TRACKING.docx**  
2051K

---

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Wed, Apr 20, 2022 at 8:50 AM


Dear Bama,  
Thank you very much. I will look at this and get back to you.  
Sincerely,  
Paul Chambers  
[Asian Affairs: An American Review](#)

Sent from my iPhone  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

## 2 attachments

 **Manuscript\_Bama\_FINAL.docx**  
1487K

 **Manuscript\_Bama\_TRACKING.docx**  
2051K

---

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Wed, Apr 20, 2022 at 6:16 PM

Dear Bama,  
Your paper is looking better but it still needs work.  
Please see my notes in your attached paper.  
1. Specifically, you still need to improve more English but I have improved a lot of it in the paper. Please incorporate my English changes. There are other English problems but I cannot fix them all. In my job as editor of this journal, I am not supposed to correct all English in a submission. Please understand that.  
2. When you have a period or . at the end of a sentence, any " or number comes afterwards. For example, ." not ".  
Please see an example of our journal. You need to change your sentences.  
3. You need to write your article's argument in the abstract, Introduction and Conclusion. Please see the attached paper.

Please take your time to make the changes.

Cheers and good luck on this,  
Paul Chambers

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **Manuscript\_Bama\_FINAL.docx**  
1498K

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <bama@unhas.ac.id>  
To: Paul Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Mon, Apr 25, 2022 at 2:04 PM

Dear Paul Chambers,

My apologies for taking some time in completing your recent revision comments. Please find attached the results of my revisions, which incorporates all of your suggestions and responds to your comments.

Regards,  
Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **REV Manuscript\_Bama\_FINAL (1).docx**  
1512K

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Mon, Apr 25, 2022 at 2:52 PM

Dear Bama,  
Thank you very much. We will look at your revisions and be back with you soon.  
Sincerely,  
Paul Chambers

Sent from my iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **REV Manuscript\_Bama\_FINAL (1).docx**  
1512K



Universitas Hasanuddin

Bama Andika Putra (Direktorat Kemitraan Internasional) &lt;bama@unhas.ac.id&gt;

---

**(Asian Affairs: An American Review) A revise decision has been made on your submission**

4 messages

---

**Paul Wesley Chambers** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Reply-To: Paul Wesley Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 26, 2022 at 3:52 PM

Ref.: Ms. No. AsianAffairs-D-22-00005

Construing Indonesia's maritime diplomatic strategies against Vietnam's Illegal, Unreported, and Unregulated Fishing in the North Natuna Sea  
Asian Affairs: An American Review

Dear Mr Putra,

Our reviewers have now considered your paper and have recommended publication in Asian Affairs: An American Review. We are pleased to accept your paper in its current form which will now be forwarded to the publisher for copy editing and typesetting. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter, along with those of the editor who coordinated the review of your paper.

You will receive proofs for checking, and instructions for transfer of copyright in due course.

The publisher also requests that proofs are checked through the publisher's tracking system and returned within 48 hours of receipt.

Thank you for your contribution to Asian Affairs: An American Review and we look forward to receiving further submissions from you.

Best regards,

Paul Wesley Chambers, Ph.D.  
Executive Editor  
Asian Affairs: An American Review

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Reviewer #1: This paper tries to explore border conflict in north Natuna between Indonesia and Vietnam. However, author(s) did not display map figuring where border overlapping claims in the Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ) between Indonesia and Vietnam is. Author (s) do use 1) kinetic effect, 2) explicitness of messages, 3) balance of power among the countries, 4) policy is reactive or pre-emptive, and 5) sustainment of policy. Why do authors prefer to use this model than other. In LR, page 5 line 38 .... not concise and coherent academic debate on this topic. In short, LR is quite poor to explore the case.

Findings

Illustrating study cases of Indonesia's maritime diplomatic characteristics against Vietnam's IUUF in the North Natuna Sea missed data presented in table or statistics.

How did data analyzed in the Figure 1. Maritime diplomatic characteristics of the five study cases related to Indonesia's maritime diplomacy against Vietnam's IUUF in the North Natuna Seas.

Reviewer #2: The paper attempts to analyze border conflicts between Vietnam and Indonesia. Using Le Mière's framework, the authors look at five cases of recent incidents of illegal fishing in Indonesian waters to construe Indonesia's diplomatic strategies. There are several issues with the paper. First, the importance of the analysis is not well explained. The paper states that Vietnam is one of the nations in conflict with Indonesia over illegal fishing disputes. China is mentioned as continuing its aggressive manoeuvres in Indonesian waters (p. 3, line 34). As such, there is the question of how serious the Vietnamese threat really is. Second, there have been several hundred cases of vessels trespassing Indonesian waters, but the study only focuses on five incidents that occurred between 2020 and 2021 (p. 2, line 46). Why only five? Based on what criteria were they selected? Third, the paper talks about trends in maritime diplomacy, but the authors only analyse five recent cases. How about the other few hundred cases during Jokowi's first presidential term? Fourth, the paper doesn't discuss the implications of the results. That is, it is unclear what insight can be obtained through the case

study analysis.

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/asianaffairs/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**Paul Wesley Chambers** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Reply-To: Paul Wesley Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 26, 2022 at 3:57 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Bama Andika Putra** <bama@unhas.ac.id>  
To: Paul Wesley Chambers <pwchambers@gmail.com>

Wed, Apr 27, 2022 at 4:44 AM

Dear Paul Chambers,

Thank you very much for this news! I will be looking forward to receiving the proofs.

Regards,  
Bama

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Paul Chambers** <pwchambers@gmail.com>  
To: Bama Andika Putra <bama@unhas.ac.id>

Wed, Apr 27, 2022 at 6:14 AM

Dear Bama,  
Congratulations. I will not be communicating with you regarding proofs. That will be another person from Taylor & Francis.  
Best,  
Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 27 Apr BE 2565, at 03:44, Bama Andika Putra <[bama@unhas.ac.id](mailto:bama@unhas.ac.id)> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]